

Gender Mainstreaming in Indonesia's Bilateral International Development Cooperation

Aswin Ariyanto Azis^{ID*} and Alifia Nur Azarine

ABSTRACT

Gender mainstreaming is an important subject to be mindful of in the Indonesian government's development cooperation with bilateral development partners. Gender conflict is one of the obstacles that countries face when executing national and international development programs. Indonesia is one of the countries that uses a gender mainstreaming technique to incorporate gender problems into development initiatives. The establishment of a gender mainstreaming strategy (PUG) is vital in developing policies, particularly in carrying out bilateral development cooperation. This is significant for Indonesia as an endeavor to decrease inequality in the country, but Indonesia's weak PUG is one of the country's impediments to fulfilling national interests. One of the strategies undertaken by Indonesia to integrate gender mainstreaming into international development is through the Triangular South-South Cooperation Forum in order to form a strategic partnership with Afghanistan and Germany. Afghanistan is seen as a potential bilateral partner with aligned interests in promoting women's empowerment and gender equality. Given that it is not only Indonesia that has national interests, the second-party countries must also have interests and conditions that are not always mutually agreed upon and might be detrimental to Indonesia. Therefore, the dynamics of bilateral cooperation between Indonesia and Afghanistan are interesting to identify, considering that GIZ, as the German representative, is present as a mediator bridging the partnership. Thus, this study aims to explain the strategy for gender mainstreaming in Indonesia's international development cooperation with bilateral partners, which is also equipped with an analysis of the constraints that affect the outcome of the cooperation.

Keywords: Bilateral partners, gender mainstreaming, international development cooperation, South Triangular Cooperation.

1. INTRODUCTION

Simply speaking, each nation takes an interest in development in order to improve its people's welfare as well as their quality of life throughout many different kinds of areas, such as infrastructures, economic growth, education, health, and socio-culture. The UN defines development as a multifaceted effort that seeks to enhance the quality of life for every individual, grounded in sustainable economic, social, and environmental strategies (United Nations, n.d.). However, the state's implementation of the development agenda sometimes faces its own obstacles and challenges, making the state unable to successfully accomplish its desired development goals. Therefore, bilateral development cooperation with other nations is a particular practice to make it easier for countries to attain development. Bilateral partnership could be defined as collaboration between two countries to fulfill their respective country's goals and to strengthen the relationship between them.

Gender was one of the aspects that eventually became the focus of the issue in the bilateral development cooperation process. Gender issues have been called crucial since they will affect how development projects are implemented in perpetuity. Furthermore, gender-related problems have an intimate connection with occurrences that take place at the human level as the target beneficiaries of the development projects (Taufiq & Listyani, 2017). Gender equality thus represents an essential element that causes the social and institutional reforms that are necessary for accomplishing sustainable

Submitted: November 04, 2023

Published: December 07, 2023

 10.24018/ejsocial.2023.3.6.516

Department of International Relations,
Brawijaya University, Indonesia.

*Corresponding Author:
e-mail: a.azis@ub.ac.id



development projects (ILO, n.d.). However, issues related to gender remain challenging, especially in developing nations such as Indonesia. One of the major reasons for this is the public's lack of awareness of the notion and role of gender.

The lack of sufficient awareness of gender conceptualization could impede the pace of development pursued by the nation's government. In order to address such challenges, the Indonesian government implemented policies designed to boost women's participation by using the gender lens as a strategic framework. This can be seen in the statement given in 2019 by the Secretary of the Ministry of National Development Planning or Bappenas, Himawan Haroyoga Djojokusuma, which is development must be based on the different needs of men and women so that later regulations implemented will be precisely on target as an act of anticipation regarding inequalities (Samodro, 2019).

The development scheme gets underway through a gender mainstreaming strategy that has been legalized by Presidential Instruction No. 9 of 2000 about Gender Mainstreaming in National Development, which applies to all national ministries and agencies involved in development planning program (Bappenas, 2007). Furthermore, these instructions have become a major consideration in the Rencana Pembangunan Jangka Menengah Nasional (RPJMN), with the recognition that women's development and empowerment are capable of being used as instruments for investment in the fields of education, health, and well-being of children in order to promote national economic growth in the future (UNCTAD, 2008). As a result, the gender mainstreaming plan is now a top priority for the Indonesian government in terms of maximizing its development initiatives and international cooperation. As a result, the purpose of this research is to provide more information about the implementation and significance of gender mainstreaming strategies in Indonesia's international development cooperation with bilateral partners.

2. CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK

2.1. *The Study of Gender Mainstreaming*

The term *gender* refers to the social construction that relates to the context of a person's sex differences. Gender also has a correlation with various characteristics that are identical to women, such as a gentle voice and a responsibility to do domestic work, as well as men, who are identical with a deep voice and duties of being the wage-earner, which became the social construction that shapes the understanding of what is allowed and what is not allowed for men and women. The limitations and stereotypes that are developed subsequently influence how the evaluation of a person is carried out depending on the inherent sex or gender. As a result, issues of disparity between genders occur within the community, affecting the decision-making process in the formation of laws and regulations (Wiasti, 2017). Consequently, the impact of gender construction affects not just people's daily activities but also a country's development.

Unfortunately, experts have failed to emphasize gender-related issues when explaining macroeconomic ideas and concepts. As a result of this, the macroeconomic theories and concepts employed by the government in policy making remain seen as inadequate in explaining economic concerns associated with gender, giving prominence to the expression gender-biased (Kabeer, 2003). It turns out that the policies established are viewed as unjust since they are implemented in an atmosphere that is still unaware of the value of gender equality (Kabeer, 2003). Staudt (2003) identifies three key approaches to gender in his work. These are gender inequality, disparities in wealth (or poverty), and stereotypes against women. Based on this work, it is feasible to conclude that gender bias and misconceptions caused by the formation of people's thinking lead to substantial differences between men and women.

2.2. *Gender Inequality*

In everyday life, gender distinction frequently results in gender disparities, especially for women. This can be seen by the existence of manifestations of injustice, which Mansour Fakih categorizes as women's marginalization, subordination, stereotypes, violence, double burden, and socialization of the ideology of gender role ideals (Mayani, 2017).

2.3. *Gender Mainstreaming in Development*

Essentially, gender and development theory (GAD) explains the importance of understanding the relational character of discrimination against women (Brouwers, 2013, p. 36). Based on this notion, the development program will be able to accomplish lasting changes through recognizing and managing power dynamics in gender. In addition, this theory highlights the necessity for structural and system reform so that gender analysis can be performed to provide disparities between men and women in order to fix gender inequality.

Researchers have further investigated the significance of gender's influence on a country's development policies, particularly by Gebre in Ethiopia, who attempts to demonstrate that an increase in gender equality correlates to an increasing rise in the output of agriculture, that is 42.3% (Gebre *et al.*, 2021). This demonstrates the importance of agricultural policies that include women in order to boost agricultural productivity. Second, Vázquez Rodríguez's research in Peru demonstrates that the enactment of gender mainstreaming policies in the labor market correlates to the country's GDP gain of 4.7% in 2007 (Vázquez Rodríguez, 2018). Third, Altuzarra *et al.* (2021) discovered in their research that gender imbalance in the education sector impedes economic growth. Therefore, nations that do not invest in women's education suffer economic losses.

In 1995, several nations convened in Beijing as a platform to debate the domestic adoption of gender mainstreaming (United Nations, 1995). The proclamation was then used as the starting point for discussing women's participation in policymaking and bureaucracy. Gender equality became an issue in institutional and policy settings as an outcome of this. The declaration also includes three strategic stages: adaptation of gender equality terminologies, gender mainstreaming in policies, and gender integrating implementation (Porter & Sweetman, 2005, p. 111). These stages serve as a barometer for the effectiveness of gender mainstreaming in policy and development that involve recognizing gender issues in policy formulation using a constructive development approach, assessing the necessity of gender perspectives with knowledge requirements as an assessment of policy selection, determining the implications of gender in decision making, deciding the actors to consult and formulating problems, defining information needs and reviewing options, and developing recommendations.

2.4. *Bilateral Aid's Economic and Political Dimensions*

Foreign aid, whether bilateral or multilateral in its structure, has a political feature at its basis. According to realist thinkers like Hans Morgenthau, the transfer of money and services from one government to another operates as a price paid for political services to be provided (Morgenthau, 1962). Morgenthau's political service context is utilized as a vehicle to achieve economic goals, whether through commercial assistance that leads to trade liberalization. Donors achieve these political goals by acquiring worldwide support as well as the possibility of providing overseas assistance that symbolizes universal welfare values. The majority of developed-country donors today consider strategies to alleviate the suffering and poverty in developing nations to be in their national interests.

This is based on having an ethos and a moral duty to take part as an organization that supports beating terrorist activity infractions, preserving the environment, enhancing the quality of human resources (including education and gender equality), and democratic governance founded on a common development agenda. However, this does not imply that providing bilateral international aid is free of political intervention (Werker, 2012). The strategy utilized in bilateral development cooperation is also becoming more directed toward national development and capacity-building initiatives (Werker, 2012). This is driven by the use of development cooperation as a media product to implement gender equality.

2.5. *Gender Mainstreaming in Official Development Assistance*

According to the Association for Women's Rights in Development (AWID), donor agencies at the bilateral and multilateral levels are important sponsors in mainstreaming gender equality and organizing women, contributing nearly 30% of total revenue globally (Clark *et al.*, 2006). Unfortunately, the overall progress of Official Development Assistance (ODA) in mainstreaming and gender equality concerns remains insufficient to meet the commitments made at the United Nations Summit on the Millennium Development Goals. This indicates that the minimal level of financing granted for gender equality is nonsensical, given that the government will likely allocate funds if there is a political motivation behind it. Stakeholders' political commitment and the establishment of an agenda are required to promote resource investment in attaining gender equality and women's rights. When the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) emerged, 17 of the 22 OECD high-income nations were members, and 15 European Union member countries agreed to meet their commitment of 0.7% of GNP received in the form of ODA until 2015 (Council Regulation, 2005). Despite this, only Turkey, Sweden, Denmark, Norway, Luxembourg, and the United Kingdom have surpassed the 0.7% threshold in 2019 (OECD, 2020).

Nonetheless, the quantity of ODA given has tended to decline, and the selection of 0.7% as the standard has been called into doubt as well since ODA allocation for gender issues hasn't shown a clear significance. Indeed, several bilateral donors, including Denmark, Ireland, the Netherlands, Norway, and Sweden, have reiterated their willingness to keep or enhance funding for gender equality and women's rights and are currently conducting a comprehensive evaluation or internal assessment of policy or program implementation. Strategies for equality and gender mainstreaming (Alpizar *et al.*, 2010). As a result, the study reveals a link between these constraints and various cases of the negative

impact of mainstreaming to promote gender equality and women's rights. As a result, they contribute to the development of new or amended policies and programs inside these bodies. For example, the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency, or SIDA, has grown the number and capacity of its workforce, which can be considered as a practical and strategic approach to satisfying the agency's equity requirements.

3. METHODS

3.1. *Types of Research*

According to Creswell, qualitative studies are excellent models that help researchers grasp and structure developments in specifics of genuine and actual phenomena that are owned (Marvasti, 2018). Furthermore, qualitative research is utilized to provide an overview, explain, and understand the data or information that has been acquired (Marvasti, 2018). The type of qualitative research used in this study is descriptive qualitative, which tries to produce a coherent narrative arrangement about the research's core theme. Furthermore, the procedures utilized in this form of research include data collection from prior research depending on the alignment of the phenomena studied.

3.2. *Types of Data*

This study makes use of secondary data, which is information gathered from internal sources such as scholarly articles, journals, official government websites, and data provided by institutions in the form of words, numbers, and pictures. Secondary data is utilized to supplement primary data in order to solve challenges linked to the research topic.

3.3. *Data Collection Techniques*

Data for this study were gathered through a survey of literature based on previous studies. This step, according to Creswell, is viewed as a search process for resources that have a relation to the phenomenon to be examined in order to prevent it. Previous study has been duplicated (Fadli, 2021). A literature evaluation was conducted using a structured characterization and examination of publications linked to the topic research (Shi, 2006). Articles, dissertations, and other research reports are examples of documents utilized in the literature review. Furthermore, in giving his presentation to explain the current concerns, the researcher collects, examines, compiles, and then methodically turns the collection of information and data collected into narrative form.

3.4. *Data Analysis Techniques*

The method of data analysis employed in this study was modified based on the type of qualitative research conducted. The data analysis approach was carried out in the following stages: data reduction, data display, and conclusion drafting.

4. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

4.1. *Indonesia's Gender Mainstreaming Strategy in International Development Cooperation with Bilateral Partners*

Indonesia is one of the countries in the world that takes part in bilateral and multilateral International development cooperation. Indonesia has also committed to achieving the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), which entails the implementation of a number of other legislation (Bappenas, 2019). One of these is Presidential Regulation (Perpres) Number 59 of 2017 on Achieving Sustainable Development Goals, which eventually provides the legal basis for stakeholders in carrying out sustainable development. According to these regulations, the roles and partnerships of many parties are vital in international development implementation since they have helped launch the implementation of Multistakeholder Partnerships (Kemitraan Multipihak/KMP) from the local to national scale. KMP is a technique approach that can be viewed as a sort of voluntary collaboration with shared ideals and active involvement of actors such as the government, business, community, and non-governmental organizations (NGOs). KMP is also seen as a work technique, methodology, and institution capable of accelerating and broadening the scope of programs and issues in the pursuit of sustainable development goals (Bappenas, 2019).

According to Beisheim and Simon (2016), collaboration with the KMP method can provide various benefits for development implementation, such as removing bureaucratic constraints so that it can move freely, collecting unlimited resources, presenting innovative solutions from various parties, and encouraging additional investment and sources of funds that are useful for problem-solving (Bappenas, 2019). KMP is also urgently required to handle public problems on a more sophisticated,

multidimensional level, even more possibly involving sectors (Bappenas, 2019). Even yet, everything is still dependent on the problem's intricacy and the context of the stakeholders' connection. The interaction between these stakeholders is critical because it impacts the extent to which services and resources may be provided, as well as the effectiveness and productiveness of development efforts.

One of the primary goals of 2030 sustainable development goals is to address the issue of gender equality. Gender equality is one of the primary problems being discussed in Indonesia in order to balance national and international development responsibilities and process engagement. Gender mainstreaming is a technique for integrating a gender perspective in development that includes processes for planning, budgeting, implementation, monitoring, and evaluating all development policies, programs, and activities (Siscawati *et al.*, 2020). Gender mainstreaming is also one of four mainstreaming techniques outlined in the National Medium-Term Development Plan (Rencana Panjang Jangka Menengah/RPJMN) for 2020–2024. Gender equality first came up in development goals in the Decree of the People's Consultative Assembly of the Republic of Indonesia Number IV/MPR/1999 concerning the Outlines of State Policy (GBHN) 2000–2004 in 1999.

Furthermore, Bappenas, together with CIDA-Canada alongside the support of the State Ministry for Women's Empowerment (KNPP), developed a tool (Gender Analysis Pathway/GAP) that was used to conduct gender analysis and formulate gender-responsive development program policies (Fithriyah, 2017). Gender equality in the GBHN was earlier stated in Law Number 25 of 2000 about the National Development Program (Propenas) for 2000–2004. Then, it continued with the publication of Presidential Instruction No. 9 of 2000 about gender mainstreaming in national development, which stated that all ministries and government agencies from the national to the regional levels in executing national development must have a gender perspective (Fithriyah, 2017).

Gender mainstreaming is primarily utilized to lower the level of difference between men and women, allowing for later optimal quality participation in development advantages. This is necessary since the gap in the distribution of development achievements in this country is frequently limited to giving advocacy and socialization solely to women (Fithriyah, 2017, p. 61). Law No. 17 of 2017 (RPJPN) 2005–2025 establishes development plans for the next 20 years in order to strengthen the implementation of gender mainstreaming. This law states that the objective of Indonesia's national development is to achieve autonomy, justice, and wealth (Siscawati *et al.*, 2020). The first stage includes determining the basic concepts in the development program, which includes governance in SDGs as regulated by the 2004–2009 National Medium-Term Development Plan (RPJMN) (Bappenas, 2012, p. 17). Gender mainstreaming in national development must be incorporated in gender-responsive planning and budgeting efforts (PPRG), according to phase two of the 2010–2015 RPJMN.

The PPRG Steering Committee and Technical Team were established in 2009 by a decree (SK) of the Minister of National Development Planning/Head of Bappenas Number KEP 30/MPPN/HK/03/2009. Afterward, the Ministry of Finance issued a Ministerial Regulation on the preparation and review of work plans and budgets of ministries/agencies, requiring each agency to run a gender analysis and prepare a Gender Budget Statement that the budget is gender-sensitive (Bappenas, 2012). Gender equality is a national goal in the sphere of people's welfare in RPJMN II 2010–2014, which strives to regulate the formulation of problems and strategic initiatives in the development and empowerment of women (Santoso, 2014). This is aimed at improving women's quality of life and roles in several spheres of development, such as exploitation, discrimination against women, reducing violence, developing PUG institutions and networks, and empowering women (Siscawati *et al.*, 2020). The gender perspective is then stressed in all sectors and at all phases of development in RPJMN III 2015–2019.

The south-south triangular cooperation is one example of implementing a gender mainstreaming strategy in development planning. Indonesia believes that developing nations can become SDG collaborators with its expertise (Ministry of Foreign Affairs, 2022). As a result, the cooperation strategies that are being implemented involve the transfer of knowledge, opportunities, and mutual benefits in order to attain development goals that are unquestionably critical to gender and women's empowerment. Indonesia is also dedicated to identifying bilateral partners, such as through the Government to Government (G2G) conference. G2G is a biannual cooperation meeting intended to maintain bilateral connections between countries such as Indonesia and Germany, Indonesia and Australia, and Indonesia and the United States (Marlina, 2021). Indonesia was able to hold negotiations with Germany during the G2G summit to establish which areas would be the focus of the development program. At the meeting, Indonesia and Germany also established activity protocols through existing partnerships so that they could later sketch out the results to be reached over the following 5 to 10 years, such as on climate, environment, sustainable economy challenges, and good governance (Marlina, 2021). In 2018, the collaboration turned its focus to the four key areas, which were also used to improve women's empowerment through legislation (Marlina, 2021).

Wisnu Utama, a representative from Bappenas, also stated that Indonesia and bilateral partners hold regular meetings for regular consultations. This regular meeting is a standard for countries that participate in bilateral collaboration, and it is used to identify areas and choose cooperation partners (Utomo & Priyanto, 2021). Indonesia was able to identify bilateral partners who aligned with its interests, such as Germany for gender and environmental issues, Japan for infrastructure concerns, America for democracy and human rights problems, and South Korea for country strategic issues related to triangular cooperation (Utomo & Priyanto, 2021). Recognizing partner countries' country strategies will make it easier for Indonesia to open discussions and reach agreements in areas that are development priorities so that they can later be used to determine donors, recipients, or other horizontal partnerships (Utomo & Priyanto, 2021). Furthermore, bilateral forums are utilized by Indonesia to exhibit cooperation plans in order to recruit and establish a positive image for potential partners. For example, at the Paris Forum, Indonesia presented the Trico program, which used gender concerns to assess its long-term viability and priority (Utomo & Priyanto, 2021).

4.2. Case Study: Triangular Cooperation Afghanistan-Indonesia-Germany

Indonesia has the Ministry of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection (KEMENPPPA) as an institution that is active in forging bilateral cooperation to continue its commitment to working with other developing nations in the field of development. KEMENPPPA works on gender mainstreaming and women's economic empowerment, among other things, through partnering with the Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan. The German government is also involved in the collaboration because it began with its participation in the South-South Triangular Cooperation. In this collaboration, Indonesia and Germany formed a bilateral partnership through representatives of the Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ), who were armed with international development knowledge that could be conveyed to the Afghan side afterward.

South-South Triangular Cooperation (SSTC) is a tool utilized by Indonesia to attain national goals, share expertise, and increase communication in order to solve global challenges (Ministry of Foreign Affairs, 2022). As a result, Indonesia has stakeholder agencies on duty in the forum, which has the primary principle of "Triangular Cooperation," namely MoFA, MoF, Bappenas, MoSS, and Indonesian Aids. From 2010 to 2017, Indonesia also contributed through 893 sustainable development cooperation programs, with 7,240 community members from various groups participating (Ministry of Foreign Affairs, 2022). All three countries agreed during the meeting to arrange a partnership through the Indonesian-Germany project. The Triangular Cooperation Project on Economic Empowerment of Women (The TriCo Project). This collaboration began in April 2019 until June 2020, with the goal of providing economic freedom to women living in conservative patriarchal societies, as well as serving as a vehicle for contributing to the achievement of SDGs number five, "Gender equality and empowering women and girls," and number 17, "Strengthening the means of implementation and revitalizing global partnerships for sustainable development" (KEMENPPPA, 2020a).

The Indonesian Ministry of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection (MoWe-CP) and the Ministry of Women's Associations of Afghanistan (MoWA) are among those working on this project. The concept used to control the TriCo development project is One Concept because it is considered suited to realizing project targets based on objective approaches and strategies adapted from other countries (KEMENPPPA, 2020b). The implementation of One Concept has a direct impact on achieving the TriCo project's KPIs. These indicators are based on best practices discussed with experts in the field of women's economic emancipation perspectives and will be carried out directly by MoWe-CP and MoWA. Women's empowerment is also included in this idea, which is implemented through the formation of a national coordinating committee on women's economic development (KEMENPPPA, 2020c, p. 17). Stakeholders in TriCo also collaborate to share information and capacities related to women's empowerment at the domestic industry level. Empowering women through home industries is crucial. Although they do not provide many material advantages, they have lower risks, so private sector players are less likely to become involved. Home industries managed by women already have Non-Governmental Organizations that play a part in them, but their function is restricted, so the government's role is required to ensure it can serve as an actor who can connect resources for promotion and take high risks for the business.

In the process, bilateral cooperation was carried out by Indonesia and Afghanistan, with GIZ serving as a German representative. The Indonesian government requested GIZ's assistance in development cooperation as a mediator to the German government in order to enter the consultation stage regarding opportunities for collaboration in Afghanistan-Indonesia-German Triangular Cooperation, and GIZ then assisted Bappenas and KEMENPPPA in developing a concept that was appropriate for Indonesia's needs. The three countries have an equal standing in this partnership but do not stand together. The point is that each country can carry out its own tasks and functions while remaining connected to the rest of the world. Germany provides financial assistance, while Indonesia shares its

experience in empowerment projects, with Afghanistan serving as a target country that receives aid in terms of both funds and Indonesia's experience (Utomo & Priyanto, 2021).

According to Neni Marlina, a GIZ representative, the "Office of the First Lady is the ministry of women's empowerment in Afghanistan born because of its commitment to belonging to a first lady, whose function is to directly regulate the involvement of women in Afghanistan" (Marlina, 2021). Since ministries differ in Indonesia and Afghanistan, various other ministries are linked to the Office of the President, the Office of the First Lady, or other big bodies. As a result, the diplomatic method used in Afghanistan for coordination reasons may differ. The coordination process between Indonesia, GIZ, and Afghanistan is "our first coordination was carried out by GIZ-Afghanistan first. Then, they coordinated with the Office of the First Lady, then the Office of the First Lady assigned the Ministry of Women's Affairs Afghanistan to discuss" (Marlina, 2021). The three parties then began to discuss GIZ, determining the possibility of cooperation and then inquiring about GIZ-Afghanistan's goals and commitments, as well as determining who the stakeholders were to participate in the collaboration. The Ministry of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection (KPPPA) will next identify KPPPA's aims before seeking development partners to fulfill the previously stated collaboration. The coordination process is carried out till the stage of meeting counterparts, encouraging conversations, concretizing the form of collaboration, giving funds and resources, and so on (Marlina, 2021).

As Indonesia's partner, GIZ plays the role of an actor capable of assisting in the formation of a collaboration ecosystem, filling gaps in Indonesia's programs, and assisting in the construction of concepts and frameworks required by Indonesia and its partners. This work is consistent with GIZ's values as a party that assists Indonesia in selecting which institutions, departments, and parties are eligible to participate in joint activities. With this assistance, Indonesia was able to take eight principles of Indonesian good practice in empowering women's economies and use them as an agenda to offer to Afghanistan, based on women's home industries operating in Wonosobo, Solok, East Lampung, Tulungagung, Central Bangka, Rembang, and Kendal. The eight principles that Indonesia possesses are as follows:

1. The government must make a strong political commitment to increasing women's economic involvement. This is essential in combating violence against women, such as human trafficking, and in providing women with access to support.
2. Assist local governments in developing home industries by implementing relevant local methodologies with distinct local community linkages.
3. Partnerships between the tourism industry, non-governmental organizations, and universities.
4. The circle-based learning model of the empowerment process is included in the successful replication of the model.
5. Women's willingness and eagerness to run home-based businesses.
6. Women in the home industry have made a commitment to form groups and support one another.
7. Formation of required collaboration to make it easier for women to access financial resources, such as those provided by banks.
8. Adapting to social and cultural norms (KEMENPPPA, 2019, pp. 30–32).

4.3. Constraints and Challenges for Gender Mainstreaming in Indonesia's Bilateral International Development Cooperation

The United Nations Development Program (UNDP) indicated in the Human Development Report (HDR) that Indonesia's Gender Development Index (IPG) placed 93 out of 155 countries in 2009 (KEMENPPPA, 2011). The GPI is an indicator designed to measure gender inequality between men and women in a country. The GDI has an impact on the Human Development Index (HDI), so the higher a country's GPA, the higher its HDI ranking. One of the challenges when attempting gender mainstreaming is the persistent belief that gender issues are part of individual difficulties specific to a certain culture. This is a problem that many countries, including Indonesia, face. As a result, although the government has highlighted this issue, the indicators are only limited to the level of women's participation, leaving out human rights, empowerment, and disparity in economic activity. Later, this will have an influence on development planning and improperly allocated budgeting. These limits frequently result in policy divergences in bilateral relationships. This is because every set of bilateral agreements signed by the government will be altered at the domestic level. Therefore, gender development will be dependent on current bureaucratic processes as well. Cultural differences and the features of each country's population also influence how a country's government responds to gender equality concerns, the expectations they have, and the interests that exist in this field.

This gap is worsened further by the fact that gender equality is still a new subject within the scope of government. Therefore, each country's approach to solving this problem is currently being debated on the partnership agenda. Budget concerns are also being contested, as there are still no references to the allocation of development funds in the gender sector. Furthermore, in the TriCo Project, for example,

challenges in acquiring money are frequently faced, resulting in limited resources employed to carry out project aspirations (KEMENPPPA, 2020a, p. 27). The TriCo Project's time limit of only fifteen months to attain its goals has prohibited it from being optimized. The period of fifteen months is also an issue because funding in Indonesia is calculated every twelve months. Therefore, there are three months left. This creates doubt about how to meet the three months of cash that the Indonesian government cannot provide. The entities within the TriCo Project are also quite distinct, with a total of 18 entities, each having its own work culture, roles, coordination systems, and management (KEMENPPPA, 2020b, p. 27). This is a challenge for the TriCo Project in terms of providing an integrated understanding to its member entities, as the community-as the object of policy implementation as a result of a bilateral partnership-becomes a challenge in the process of dissemination and implementation of government policies, particularly at the provincial and regency/municipal levels, so the participation of women in a field has a significant impact on the success of gender mainstreaming policies.

The final issue in Afghanistan is cooperation throughout multiple tiers of players. Despite efforts to integrate the movement of all stakeholders through One Concept and Best Practice, Afghanistan has diverse bureaucratic dynamics (KEMENPPPA, 2020c, p. 27). In Afghanistan, the vice president must approve the multi-sector protocol that is being established. Thus, coordination and other talks within the appropriate fiscal year are required to correctly implement the concept and guarantee the practice is included in the Ministry of National Planning. As a result, it is this bureaucratic process that slows down implementation in a short period of time (15 months) and has an impact on TriCo coordination, which is carried out through One Concept and Best Practice.

In addition to the previously mentioned difficulties, Indonesia faces a new one: a lack of ownership of Gender Focal Points. Gender Focal Points are crucial in facilitating the process of adapting the notion of gender mainstreaming in institutions and standardization associated with bureaucracy, particularly in ministries. In the absence of a Gender Focal Point, responsible state apparatus may tend to overrule women's interests in institutions, making policymaking rarely side with women's interests (Marlina, 2021). The constraints encountered then also apply in the external sphere; for example, in the cooperation between Indonesia and Afghanistan, these two countries continue to have strong interference from Islamic religious values, so gender issues are still regarded as sensitive issues that intersect with norms and socio-culture. Nonetheless, with German support, Indonesia was able to overcome this challenge. To address this, Indonesia and Germany shifted the focus of the cooperation program from women's empowerment to women's economic empowerment under the guise that this activity aimed to increase family income rather than increasing women's role in the family.

Indonesia has also made a commitment via a memorandum of understanding (MoU), although it has not been completely executed. The activities carried out by the Indonesian government tend to focus solely on maintaining the agreement's articles and are not yet deep in terms of technical capabilities. In the case of triangular cooperation, the agreement was reached because Indonesia did not want the Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) between Indonesia and the bilateral countries to go dormant because its validity period was coming. Neni Marlina then explained that this was done as an effort to initiate, but in the process of discussing Indonesian concepts, it sometimes took very long to reach six months, even though concepts were mandatory questions that had to be thought about and often this was a formality answer for Indonesia (Marlina, 2021). To prepare for this, Indonesia engaged GIZ to be a collaborative partner in partnership to help with the formation of strategic points. However, not all ministries or agencies in Indonesia truly require technical partners, considering that each has its own set of needs and Key Performance Indicators (KPI), but are just unsure where the funding will go and where to focus their efforts. This is also prompted by the movement of proactive institutions that face a number of internal challenges that impede their success (Marlina, 2021).

4.4. *Lessons from Indonesia's Bilateral International Development Cooperation*

The following lessons can be drawn from Indonesia's and bilateral partners' practice of international development cooperation through South-South Triangular Cooperation:

1. The pre-workshop briefing prepares all stakeholders to actively and successfully contribute.
2. Implementation of effective strategies for knowledge exchange in the form of learning activities, modules, and facilities.
3. The importance of well-documented business procedures in project implementation cannot be overstated.
4. A clear definition of all project phases is essential for good project management.
5. Conduct monitoring and evaluation to ensure that SSTC projects have a high impact.
6. It is critical to instill a strong sense of ownership in initiatives in order to foster a strong sense of responsibility and dedication.
7. The project helps to strengthen the roles of both NCT KSS Indonesia and CP KPP as the Ministry of Implementation.

8. The program promotes the development of domestic industry in Indonesia.
9. There is consistency in cooperation.
10. Precautionary measures in the event of a pandemic.
11. Flexibility aids in the acceleration of TriCo to reach its output ([KEMENPPPA, 2020a](#), p. 13).

The following are the lessons that Afghanistan may learn from Indonesia in terms of realistic promotion strategies for women's home industries:

1. Because Indonesian home industries use local materials, they are less expensive.
2. Village-level women's clubs are formed;
3. District-level women's cooperatives are formed;
4. Indonesia has a ministry responsible for cooperatives and small and medium-sized businesses.
5. Female practitioners of the cottage sector have easy access to funding.
6. Packaging training is available.
7. Use standard packaging.
8. Non-governmental organizations (NGOs) are being mobilized in some sectors relevant to the promotion of female home industry practitioners.
9. All stakeholders work closely together.
10. The government has a policy encouraging the usage of locally produced goods.
11. Religious leaders have expressed their support.
12. Women in the home sector have launched and used e-commerce to advertise their items ([KEMENPPPA, 2020b](#), p. 13).

The achievements that can be achieved by Afghanistan-Indonesia-Germany in the women's economic development project in the Triangular cooperation are as follows:

1. Indonesia was able to collect 8 (eight) good practices in strengthening women's economies through home industries ([KEMENPPPA, 2020c](#)).
2. This collaboration was successful in developing a concept known as the One Concept of Women's Economic Empowerment in Afghanistan, whose document was co-created by the Indonesian Ministry of Women's Empowerment and the Ministry of Women's Affairs of Afghanistan.
3. Afghanistan was successful in presenting the One Concept concept to potential donors in Afghanistan, and it has been adapted in several pilot project areas such as Samangan Province and Hazrat Sultan Dist. Furthermore, this program has succeeded in bringing out more than 300 people who have become figures in empowering women in Afghanistan ([Marlina, 2021](#)).
4. The Afghanistan-Indonesia-Germany Triangular Cooperation Project on Women's Economic Empowerment was prepared, which included project achievements, lessons learned, and challenges. This document is expected to be a reference or guide for countries in conducting cooperation practices.

Based on the explanation above, it is clear that Indonesia has succeeded in opening the minds of Afghan women to the value of family and societal activity. The presence of social media and the forums that come from this collaboration encourages Afghan women to take control of collaborative practices that are supported by transparency and adaptability ([Marlina, 2021](#)). So far, five elements of Indonesian good practice standards have been adopted by Afghanistan. This was then supported by Indonesia's achievements, as documented in the document "7 Steps to Developing a Home Industry-Reflections on Indonesia's Experience in Women's Economic Empowerment," prepared by the Ministry of Women Empowerment and Child Protection.

5. CONCLUSION

Indonesia is one of the countries committed to carrying out development as a means of achieving SDG number five, namely gender equality. As a result, the Indonesian government is currently attempting to incorporate gender mainstreaming into all development policies and programs. Gender mainstreaming (PUG) is one of four mainstreaming techniques outlined in the 2020–2024 National Medium-Term Development Plan (RPJMN) to make each sector of development more gender progressive. This is required since the advantages of progress are still not spread equitably, and there are still gaps in society as a result of various laws that injure women or are anti-gender. Thus, gender-oriented development must be carried out at all ministries and institutions at the national and regional levels, beginning with planning, program/policy design, budgeting, implementation, monitoring, and evaluation.

Gender mainstreaming is being exploited as a fresh opportunity in Indonesia to continue executing cooperative international development operations with bilateral partners such as Germany and

Afghanistan. A partnership including Indonesia and GIZ as the German party to enable initiatives to empower women in Afghanistan is one of the development cooperation programs that adopt a gender mainstreaming strategy. Based on the programs performed by Indonesia, GIZ, and Afghanistan over the last two years, eight (8) learning values have been identified that Afghanistan can adopt.

The Ministry of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection (PPPA) noted that gender mainstreaming growth in Indonesia is still in its early stages, despite the fact that several of its ministries have begun to incorporate gender mainstreaming into all program implementation and decision-making. Indonesia's stumbling gender mainstreaming is owing to a variety of impediments, including limits inside Indonesian institutions and constraints in the implementation of development projects. These limits face Indonesia, as well as partner countries, for bilateral development cooperation, particularly in efforts to achieve gender mainstreaming.

The first barrier to gender mainstreaming is the belief that gender is an individual problem tied to a certain culture. Even though the government has included gender mainstreaming in policies, this hinders efforts to mainstream gender, making it harder to apply throughout society. Second, development planning and budgeting are not carried out effectively since gender mainstreaming is still measured in terms of women's involvement rather than human rights, empowerment, and economic disparity. The two barriers to gender mainstreaming have an impact on policy incompatibility, which has ramifications for bilateral cooperation practice. This is a barrier in bilateral development, as are differences in culture and society from each nation, which have a significant impact on how countries react to gender equality issues, their expectations, and their interests in gender issues.

The challenges must be recognized and become points of progress for Indonesia in implementing a gender mainstreaming strategy, particularly in the TriCo bilateral cooperation. The first impediment is a lack of funding for the implementation of bilateral projects, which has an impact on the limited resources that can be employed to assist the project. Second, because there are only fifteen months to accomplish the program, the goals being tried are considered less than desirable. Furthermore, due to financing limits in Indonesia, the calculation of money is calculated every twelfth, whereas the program has an excess of three months. The project implementers were unsure how to make up the shortfall in the remaining three months of the project.

Third, there is an obstacle in delivering integrated knowledge to entity members because TriCo includes eight (8) varied entities, each with its own work culture, duties, coordination methods, and management. Fourth, there is the issue of coordination between multiple layers of players, particularly on the Afghan side. Even if the direction of movement of stakeholders in Afghanistan has been integrated through One Concept and Best Practice, they still have to deal with diverse bureaucratic dynamics, which slow down project development. Fifth, Indonesia still lacks a gender focal point, which causes adaptation of the concept of gender mainstreaming in institutions to collide with bureaucracy and standardization of each individual institution. Sixth, Indonesia, and Afghanistan have cultural differences. Seventh, Indonesia still lacks technical qualities such as conceptualization and strategic planning.

Despite the fact that Indonesia still faces numerous difficulties and problems, several Indonesian institutions have attempted to implement a gender mainstreaming strategy in decision-making and the implementation of work projects, particularly development projects. Furthermore, Indonesia has eight advantages that are the main principles in development, particularly women's empowerment, and are expected to become a learning model or foundation for women's empowerment not only in all regions of Indonesia but also for other countries, not just Afghanistan.

Based on the eight main principles that have become practical lessons from Indonesia in development cooperation related to women's empowerment, the values that can be taken are the importance of pre-workshop briefings that can prepare all stakeholders to be active and effective in contributing, the necessity of learning activities in the form of modules and facilities, documentation in the implementation project, clear definition of project stages, monitoring and evaluation, and a need for a women's empowerment strategy. Implementing a development project based on this principle will facilitate the provision of infrastructure to ensure the project's sustainability and the necessity for an anticipatory approach to various types of dangers, such as during a pandemic.

Indonesia already has a variety of instruments and is aware of the shortcomings and obstacles that will be encountered while carrying out bilateral cooperation projects, particularly those aimed at empowering women. Strategically, Indonesia cannot be described as a country that is domestically strong in implementing its gender mainstreaming policy. However, in international development initiatives based on gender equality, particularly women's empowerment, Indonesia can be concluded to be good and can serve as a model for other countries. Therefore, the hope is that Indonesia will continue to strengthen its good performance, particularly in the implementation of gender mainstreaming within Indonesian institutions/ministries, so that when development initiatives based on gender mainstreaming are implemented, they will be maximized.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

This study was conducted independently by authors from the International Relations department in Universitas Brawijaya without any financial support from foreign or domestic actors.

CONFLICT OF INTEREST

The authors declare that they do not have any conflict of interest.

REFERENCES

- Alpizar, L., Clark, C., Pittman, A., Rosenhek, S., & Vidal, V. (2010). *Fund Her Research Update Brief 1: Trends in Bilateral and Multilateral Funding*. Mexico: Association for Women's Rights in Development. https://www.srhr-ask-us.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/07/AWID_2010_Brief1_TrendsInBilateralMultilateralFunding-1.pdf.
- Altuzarra, A., Gálvez-Gálvez, C., & González-Flores, A. (2021). Is gender inequality a barrier to economic growth? A panel data analysis of developing countries. *Sustainability*, *13*(1), 1–21.
- Bappenas (2007). *Analisis Gender dalam Perencanaan Pembangunan [Gender Analysis in Development Planning]*. Jakarta: Bappenas.
- Bappenas (2012). *Kerangka Strategi Nasional Percepatan Pengarusutamaan Gender Melalui Perencanaan dan Penganggaran yang Responsif Gender [National Strategies Framework on Gender Mainstreaming through gender responsive planning and budgeting]*. Jakarta: Bappenas.
- Bappenas (2019). *Panduan Kemitraan Multipihak: Untuk Pelaksanaan Tujuan Pembangunan Berkelanjutan di Indonesia [Guidance for Multi-Stakeholders Partnership: For the Implementation of Sustainable Development in Indonesia]*. Jakarta: Bappenas.
- Beisheim, M., & Simon, N. (2016). Multi-stakeholder partnerships for implementing the 2030 agenda: Improving accountability and transparency. Analytical Paper for the 2016 ECOSOC Partnership Forum. *SSRN Electronic Journal*. <https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.2767464>.
- Brouwers, R. (2013). Revisiting gender mainstreaming in international development: Goodbye to an illusory strategy. *ISS Working Paper Series/General Series*, *556*(556), 1–36.
- Clark, C., Sprenger, E., & VeneKlasen, L. (2006). *Where is the Money for Women's Rights? Assessing the Resources and the Role of Donors in the Promotion of Women's Right and Support of Women's Organization*. Washington, DC: The Association of Women's Rights in Development (AWID). https://www.awid.org/sites/default/files/atoms/files/assessing_resources_and_role_of_donors_fundher.pdf.
- Council Regulation (2005). Accelerating progress toward the millennium development goals. The council of the European union. <https://eur-lex.europa.eu/EN/legal-content/summary/accelerating-progress-towards-achieving-the-millennium-development-goals-mdg.html>.
- Fadli, M. R. (2021). Memahami desain metode penelitian kualitatif [Understanding the design of qualitative research methods]. *Humanika*, *21*(1), 33–54. <https://doi.org/10.21831/hum.v21i1.38075>.
- Fithriyah, F. (2017). Indonesia's experience: Implementing gender responsive planning and budgeting. *Jurnal Perencanaan Pembangunan*, *1*(1), 59–75.
- Gebre, G. G., Isoda, H., Rahut, D. B., Amekawa, Y., & Nomura, H. (2021). Gender differences in agricultural productivity: Evidence from maize farm households in southern Ethiopia. *GeoJournal*, *86*(2), 843–864.
- ILO (n.d.). Gender and development. <https://www.ilo.org/global/topics/economic-and-social-development/gender-and-development/lang-en/index.htm>.
- Kabeer, N. (2003). *Gender Mainstreaming in Poverty Eradication and the Millennium Development Goals: A Handbook for Policy-Makers and Other Stakeholders*. London: International Development Research Centre.
- KEMENPPPA (2011). Pengarusutamaan gender [Gender mainstreaming] (Policy Paper 1). <https://www.kemenpppa.go.id/lib/uploads/list/51014-35739-1.-pengarusutamaan-gender.pdf>.
- KEMENPPPA (2019). *Best Practices on Women Empowerment through Home Industry in Indonesia*. Jakarta: Indonesian Ministry of Women Empowerment and Child Protection.
- KEMENPPPA (2020a). *Lessons Learnt & Conclusions for the Practice of Indonesia's South-South and Trilateral Cooperation*. Jakarta: Indonesian Ministry of Women Empowerment and Child Protection.
- KEMENPPPA (2020b). *One Concept for the Economic Empowerment of Women in Conditions of Patriarchal Societies*. Jakarta: Indonesian Ministry of Women Empowerment and Child Protection, Ministry of Women Affairs of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan.
- KEMENPPPA (2020c, July 21). Afghanistan berhasil terapkan praktik baik pemberdayaan ekonomi perempuan Indonesia [Afghanistan successfully implements good practices for the economic empowerment of Indonesian women] (Press Release Number: B-165/Set/Rokum/MP 01/07/2020). <https://www.kemenpppa.go.id/index.php/page/read/29/2796/afghanistan-berhasil-terapkan-praktik-baik-pemberdayaan-ekonomi-perempuan-indonesia>.
- Marlina, N. (2021, October 28). Wawancara Penelitian Strategi Pengarusutamaan Gender Indonesia dalam Kerjasama Pembangunan Internasional dengan Mitra Bilateral [Research Interview on Gender Mainstreaming on Indonesia International Development Cooperation with bilateral partners]. (A. A. Azis, F. A. Istiqomah, O. Xavier, & A. F. Azzahra, Interviewers).
- Marvasti, A. (2018). Research methods. In A. J. Trevino (Ed.), *The Cambridge handbook of social problems* (pp. 23–38). Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press. <https://doi.org/10.1017/9781108656184.003>.
- Mayani, A. L. (2017, May 18). *Analisis Gender dan Transformasi Sosial Karya Mansour Fakih [Gender Analysis and Social Transformation by Mansour Fakih]*. Yogyakarta: Insist Press. <http://badanbahasa.kemdikbud.go.id/lamanbahasa/sites/default/files/Hasil>.
- Ministry of Foreign Affairs. (2022, December 9). Colombo plan. Ministry of foreign affairs of the Republic of Indonesia. https://www.kemlu.go.id/portal/en/read/139/halaman_list_lainnya/colombo-plan.
- Morgenthau, H. (1962). A political theory of foreign aid. *American Political Science Review*, *56*(2), 301–309.
- OECD (2020). Aid by DAC members increases in 2019 with more aid to the poorest countries (Report). <https://www.oecd.org/dac/financing-sustainable-development/development-finance-data/ODA-2019-detailed-summary.pdf>.
- Porter, F., & Sweetman, C. (Eds.) (2005). *Mainstreaming Gender in Development: A Critical Review*. Oxford, UK: Oxfam.
- Samodro, D. (2019, November 27). *Bappenas: Perspektif Gender Penting Dalam Pembangunan [Bappenas: Gender Perspective is Important in Development]*. Antara News. <https://www.antaranews.com/berita/1182623/bappenas-perspektif-gender-penting-dalam-pembangunan>.

- Santoso, W. M. (2014). *Penelitian dan Pengarusutamaan Gender: Sebuah Pengantar [Research and Gender Mainstreaming: An Introduction]*. Jakarta: LIPI Press.
- Shi, S. (2006). Literature review: An overview (EDU 651 Fall 2006 Lecture Notes). <https://web.cortland.edu/shis/651/LitRevOverview.pdf>.
- Siscawati, M., Adelina, S., Aggriani, S., & Eveline, R. (2020). *Background Study Rencana Pembangunan Jangka Menengah Nasional (RPJMN) 2020–2024 Bidang Kesetaraan Gender dan Pemberdayaan Perempuan [Midterm Development Planning RPJMN 2020–2024 Gender Mainstreaming and Women Empowerment Sector]*. Jakarta: Bappenas.
- Staudt, K. (2003). Gender mainstreaming: Conceptual links to institutional machineries. In S. M. Rai (Eds.), *Mainstreaming Gender, Democratizing the State* (pp. 40–66). New York: Routledge.
- Taufiq, M. N., & Listyani, R. H. (2017). Pembangunan berbasis gender mainstreaming (Studi analisis gender implementasi program gender watch di gresik) [Development based gender mainstreaming analysis study of gender program in Gresik]. *Paradigma*, 5(3), 1–6.
- UNCTAD (2008). *Mainstreaming Gender into Trade and Development Strategies in Africa (Report)*. New York and Geneva: United Nations Conference on Trade and Development. https://unctad.org/system/files/official-document/ditctncd200713_en.pdf.
- United Nations (1995). *Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action*. New York: United Nations. <https://www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/beijing/pdf/BDPfA%20E.pdf>.
- United Nations (n.d.). UN documentation: Development. <https://research.un.org/en/docs/dev>.
- Utomo, W., & Priyanto, R. (2021, November 12). Wawancara penelitian strategi pengarusutamaan gender indonesia dalam kerjasama pembangunan internasional dengan mitra bilateral [Research Interview on Gender Mainstreaming on Indonesia International Development Cooperation with bilateral partners]. (A. A. Azis, F. A. Istiqomah, O. Xavier, & A. F. Azzahra, Interviewers).
- Vásconez Rodríguez, A. (2018). Economic growth and gender inequality: An analysis of panel data for five Latin American countries. *CEPAL Review*, 2017(122), 79–106.
- Werker, E. (2012). The political economy of bilateral foreign aid (SSRN Scholarly Paper 2141977). <https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.2141977>.
- Wiaati, N. M. (2017). Mencermati permasalahan gender dan pengarusutamaan gender (PUG) [Understanding gender problems and gender mainstreaming]. *Sunari Penjor: Journal of Anthropology*, 1(1), 29–42.